



Office of the City Manager

INFORMATION CALENDAR

March 12, 2019

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

From: Dee Williams-Ridley, City Manager

Submitted by: Phillip L. Harrington, Director, Department of Public Works

Subject: Audit Status Report: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal

INTRODUCTION

The Office of the City Auditor presented to the City Council a July 1, 2014 Report: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal<sup>1</sup> (Audit Report). The City Auditor conducted the Audit Report at the Public Works Director's request to assess Public Works' Zero Waste Division progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal. This is the third semi-annual Information Calendar Update on the efforts made to implement the Audit Report's recommendations.

CURRENT SITUATION AND ITS EFFECTS

The Audit Report noted fifteen (15) recommendations for the Public Works Department (PWD) and its Zero Waste Division (ZWD) to review, implement and report to Council. The first set of seven (7) recommendations were related to zero waste goals and ZWD's operational components and the second set of eight (8) recommendations focused on PW/ZWD working with the Department of Information Technology (IT) to utilize technology to interface with routes, staff and the customers.

As of the writing of this Audit Report, three recommendations have been implemented, six recommendations are partially implemented; five recommendations remain unimplemented; and one recommendation has been declined with a will not implement status.

Please see Attachment 1 for a detailed table of audit report recommendations, corrective actions and implementation progress. The next report to Council is expected to be presented on March 2020 to allow Zero Waste to develop and implement a Strategic Plan.

---

<sup>1</sup> [https://www.cityofberkeley.info/uploadedFiles/Auditor/Level\\_3\\_-\\_General/A%2020\\_RPT\\_Zero%20Waste\\_Final.pdf](https://www.cityofberkeley.info/uploadedFiles/Auditor/Level_3_-_General/A%2020_RPT_Zero%20Waste_Final.pdf)

## BACKGROUND

On March 22, 2015, the Berkeley City Council adopted Zero Waste Resolution No. 62,849-N.S reaffirming its commitment to meet the Alameda County Measure D goal of reducing waste sent to landfills by 75%, and setting a goal of zero waste sent to landfills by year 2020. The Resolution does not define a specific zero waste percentage expectation for Berkeley, but the language used therein implies that the Council's intention is diversion of 100 percent of waste from landfills.

In its October 17, 2017 presentation of the Zero Waste Strategic Plan to the City Council, the Zero Waste Commission recommended the City move forward immediately to meet our Zero Waste Goal by updating the Zero Waste Goal for current feasibility and issuing an RFP to hire a consultant to develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan intended to lead the City toward that goal. The City Council consented to this recommendation.

## ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY

The increased diversion of recyclable materials, such as, cardboard, paper, plastic, etc., from the wastes being landfilled is an essential part of the City's Zero Waste Goal as described in the City's 2009 Climate Action Plan.

## POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION

The Zero Waste Commission and the Zero Waste Division are continuing to address the remaining nine recommendations in the Audit.

## FISCAL IMPACTS OF POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION

There will be fiscal impacts for the procurement of software, hardware, and professional services necessary to complete the Audit findings. Public Works will continue to update the Council on a periodic basis on the progress, resources available or to be made available, and/or additional funding needs in subsequent updates assessing Zero Waste Division's efforts.

## CONTACT PERSON

Greg Apa, Solid Waste & Recycling Manager (510) 981-6359

### Attachment:

1. Audit Findings and Recommendations Response Form

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
<b>Finding 1: Insufficient data and resources (for planning, strategy, or execution) dedicated to Berkeley’s zero waste by 2020 resolution</b>				
1.1	Request the City Council to redefine and then reaffirm its commitment to zero waste (i.e., the percentage that the Council considers to be success), and to ensure sufficient resources to fund appropriate staffing and the necessary infrastructure to achieve stated goals by 2020.	Public Works  Agree  This is consistent with the strategic approach the Public Works Department has taken to correct operational deficiencies and create an organization more capable of continuing the work to reach the City’s zero waste goal.  The Department is poised to undertake an open search for a new ZWD Manager whose input, perspective, and anticipated professional expertise will be essential in analyzing the resources necessary to achieve the goal and drafting suitable recommendations to Council.	June 2015  June 2019	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  <u><b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b></u> <u><b>Not Implemented</b></u> The Zero Waste Commission submitted to the City Council its recommendation for the City to develop an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City’s Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The City Council concurred with this recommendation which was an item on its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar for the Zero Waste Division to develop the RFP for the development of the Plan.



ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
including annual or biennial interim waste diversion goals. Topics that the strategic plan should discuss include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Objectives and long-term and interim goals</li> <li>• Actions to be taken</li> <li>• Responsible parties</li> <li>• Expected cost and impact of implementation</li> <li>• Performance measures</li> <li>• External factors affecting performance and progress</li> </ul>		making progress toward our zero waste goal. The Department improved the efficiency of operations, followed the strategies in the Climate Action Plan, is currently completing a commercial franchise study, and in May 2014 completed a Prop 218-compliant rate increase. PW will continue to focus on maintaining efficient operations, high quality customer service, and improvements to waste diversion efforts.  The Department will take the next step toward zero waste by reassessing the current situation, and developing a strategic plan intended to guide the Department through the increasingly difficult path to zero waste. Part of this process requires evaluating the existing Transfer Station infrastructure, along with what		<b><u>Not Implemented</u></b> The City's Solid Waste Management Plan (1998) and Source Reduction and Recycling Element (1992) are the City's most recent documents guiding the City's actions toward the goal of zero waste. Although the City's Solid Waste Management Plan Update (2005) wasn't formerly adopted by the City, it was designed to achieve the 2010 goal of reaching 75% diversion. The City is currently achieving 76% diversion based on FY2015 information. The Zero Waste Commission and the City Auditor each concluded independently that a comprehensive, written strategic plan that clearly defines roles and responsibilities and assigns sufficient resources is needed to guide the City towards the goal of achieving zero waste. The



ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
				ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review.
1.3	Public Works	<p>Agree</p> <p>Public Works will continue to prepare its annual work plan under the direction of the City Manager, in coordination and consistent with other Department work plans.</p> <p>Goals, objectives, and actions for the Zero Waste program will be organized and managed by the Zero Waste Manager.</p>	June 2019	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b>January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented</b></p> <p>The Zero Waste Commission submitted to the City Council its recommendation for the City to develop an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• completion</li> <li>• Lead staff responsible for task completion</li> <li>• Full-time equivalent employees assigned to the tasks</li> <li>• Performance measures</li> </ul>				<p>Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The City Council concurred with this recommendation which was an item on its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar for the Zero Waste Division to develop the RFP for the development of the Plan.</p> <p>With a third-party firm in-place, the Plan development will proceed with all stakeholders' input solicited, reviewed and included. With approved by both the Zero Waste Commission and City Council, a fully vetted and approved Zero Waste Strategic Plan will provide Public Works a detailed road map to attain a zero waste goal. With these elements agree to then annual/biennial goals, budget allocations, timelines for completion, employees' assigned task and performance</p>



ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
			December 2019	<p>measures will be concisely identified and assigned to meet the zero waste goal.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b>  <b><u>Partially implemented</u></b></p> <p>ZWD is drafting an RFP for a Zero Waste Strategic plan to guide the City's policy and decision making and paths of implementation to the goal of Zero Waste. IT and ZWD is in the process of selecting a vendor to implement an entirely new ZW software solution that includes routing, billing and work orders. ZW meets weekly with key PW staff to ensure division objectives and action items are prioritized and budgeted for. With the first reading and passing of the Single Use Foodware and Litter Reduction Ordinance on January 22, 2019, ZWD is working closely with PW</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>					
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>		<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
					Fiscal and Admin division to budget for adequate staffing for this new responsibility. ZWD anticipates completion of a Feasibility Study to replace the existing Transfer Station by mid-2019. ZWD primary objectives are in accordance with the Citywide Strategic Plan. Once the new ZW software system is in place and the Strategic Plan has been completed, a more accurate work plan could be created that would include performance measures.
1.4	Regularly communicate zero- waste goals and achievements to City staff and the Council, and offer training to staff on how they can help Berkeley achieve zero waste. This includes	Public Works	Agree  Prepare an annual report to Council, highlighting progress toward strategic plan and work plan goals to achieve zero waste in Berkeley.	December 2019	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  <b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b> <b>Partially Implemented</b> With the newly re-staffed ZWC and new management at Zero Waste Division and once the Strategic Plan is completed and

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
sharing strategic and annual work plan goals and regular updates regarding progress and completion.				as part of the Strategic Plan, the Work Plan with goals, budget, timelines, FTEs and measurements will be developed. Then, Public Works will initiate annual reporting to Council. Nonetheless progress has been made, such as: the ZWD has undertaken a City Facilities Greening Project to ensure that all City-owned facilities have the appropriate containers with signage for trash, recyclables (bottles/cans and fiber), and organics; and that City staff receive training on the acceptable materials to place in each container type. The recent, May through September 2017, renovation of 1947 Center Street is being used as a pilot for this Project. In celebration of Earth Day 2017, the ZWD hosted a Zero Waste Earth Day Fair for City

ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
				<p>employees to get answers to all of their recycling-related questions, play games, enjoy zero waste snacks, and talk trash with ZWD staff. This event was attended by more than 100 City employees.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b>  <b><u>Partially Implemented</u></b></p> <p>City staff have been encouraged to participate in the visioning sessions for the Transfer Station Redesign January 16, 17, and 18. <a href="https://www.cityofberkeley.info/City_Manager/Press_Releases/2019/2019-01-02_Workshop_City_needs_your_ideas_for_new_recycling_and_waste_transfer_station.aspx">https://www.cityofberkeley.info/City_Manager/Press_Releases/2019/2019-01-02_Workshop_City_needs_your_ideas_for_new_recycling_and_waste_transfer_station.aspx</a></p> <p>Also, ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
				Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review. Once the strategic plan is completed, it will be shared with City staff.
1.5	Determine if additional funds are needed for the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero-waste goals. If sufficient funds are not available, propose to Council a separate fee to cover those costs for the City's zero- waste program, such as a regulatory fee as allowed under Proposition 218.	Public Works	Agree The Public Works Strategic Plan process will evaluate and identify the necessary resources, and if funding is insufficient, a recommendation will be made to consider an Integrated Waste Management Fee or other appropriate mechanism to fund additional staffing and/or outreach needs.	December 2019  <b>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</b>  <b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b> <b>Partially Implemented</b> Since September 2016, Public Works has hired the Zero Waste Division's Solid Waste & Recycling Manager, Greg Apa, and Recycling Program Manager, Heidi Obermeit, who have 29 and 10 years, respectively, of solid waste industry experience. With their extensive background in the solid waste industry, they are in the process of reviewing, assessing and addressing Zero Waste's current efforts to

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
				<p>educate and as needed the expansion of educational outreach to the community members and commercial businesses, both existing and new. Outreach educational materials are somewhat dated and these materials may be updated and customized as required with more current graphics and narratives.</p> <p>In addition, the ZWD has hired a Field Service Representative who assists ZWD’s education and compliance efforts with all community members and businesses.</p> <p>In 2018, the current Council-approved rate structure will require an updated rate study including the cost of increased educational outreach and training for handling of recyclable materials to ensure a sustainable rate structure to</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
				<p>achieve the zero waste goals that the Council has set for Public Waste and Zero Waste Division.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b>  <b><u>Partially Implemented</u></b></p> <p>Public Works has determined through internal budget process that Zero Waste needs two additional full time staff members to oversee the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero-waste goals. The Zero Waste Division will be determining additional funding beyond staffing needed to increase education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement during the strategic planning process. The RFP for the strategic plan process is currently under administrative review. This process will also identify if the current levels of fees can cover the costs of the</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
				City's Zero Waste program or if Public Works will need to assess additional fees.
1.6 Update the City's Zero Waste website to include easily accessible information regarding: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How and where to recycle materials that are not accepted in curbside collection.</li> <li>• What can be brought to the transfer station and materials recovery facility.</li> <li>• Zero waste goals and progress toward those goals.</li> </ul> <a href="http://StopWaste.org">StopWaste.org</a> is a good example and has	Public Works	Agree	October 2016	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  <b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b> <b>Implemented</b> With the hiring of the Recycle Program Manager, ZWD is continuously streamlining and updating the City's and ZWD's website to include: guidelines to recycle plant debris and food waste; information on the mandatory recycling requirements for businesses and multi-family properties in Alameda County; and links to other recycling resources in the area. Further, the ZWD has made available guidelines to help designers of multifamily, commercial, and mixed-use buildings plan for recycling collection when designing new



ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
<p>resources that Berkeley can direct customers to use.</p> <p>Updates should be made as changes are made to the list of materials accepted through each waste stream.</p>				<p>buildings or renovations. In conjunction with the City's Public Information Officer, the ZWD has distributed press releases to educate the general public about the appropriate material to place in their refuse, recycling and green compost carts, extra pick-up bags, proper cart placement.</p>
<p>1.7 Engage in discussions with the California Department of Resources Recycling and Recovery to obtain permission to collect garbage biweekly instead of weekly while maintaining weekly collection of compostables. Perform additional education and outreach prior to implementing biweekly garbage service to</p>	<p>Public Works</p>	<p>Agree</p> <p>The ZWD will investigate the process of obtaining legal permission to pilot biweekly rubbish collection. We will identify the operational and outreach preparation necessary to evaluate the feasibility of this pilot.</p>	<p>N/A</p>	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b></p> <p><b>Will not be Implemented</b></p> <p>Although a Solid Waste &amp; Recycling Manager and Recycling Program Manager is on staff, the Zero Waste Division, as an enterprise funded collection service division, is unstaffed and inexperienced to engage in the process change of State Law, which requires weekly collection of refuse. In addition, this would</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
<p>educate the public on the change. Alternatively, seek permission to implement a pilot project for biweekly garbage service.</p>				<p>require significant lobbying of CalRecycle to approve a pilot program to collect refuse other than on a weekly basis. The Audit Report states that there is the potential of \$496,000 annual cost savings by switching to biweekly garbage service. However and as noted in the Audit Report, this is based on assumptions which:                      1) State law requires the refuse shall not remain on any premises more than seven (7) days. Berkeley would need to revise the State law, request a waiver or seek permission for a pilot program. This waiver or revision of State law will potentially require substantial lobbying members of City Council, State House of Representative(s) and Senator(s), as well as, of all the many County and State permitting and health agencies</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>					
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>		<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
					that would be involved to amend State law. 2) Require additional staff and funding to support a community educational outreach to ensure that refuse is not just reallocated by community members to the recycling and plant debris carts. 3) Public Works would need to enter into negotiations with the employee bargaining unit to an agreement whether positions can be eliminated through attrition or reassignment.
<b>Finding 2: Limited use of available technologies affects operational efficiencies</b>					
2.1	Work with the Department of Information Technology to configure the CRM system with a required field that auto populates valid route information based on address and service delivery type so	Public Works	Agree	December 2019	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  <u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u> Not implemented Currently the City is implementing an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) project to replace the FUNDS\$ system including the CRM application.

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
<p>that route-specific data can be collected on a going-forward basis.</p>			<p>December 2019</p>	<p>ERP is a software with financial (accounting, billing, budget, contracts) and human resource (time entry, personnel, payroll, benefits) applications. As part of this project, ZWD has been working with IT and its consultant during the needs assessment phase to ensure that RouteSmart™ will interface with the selected software.</p> <p><b><u>June 4, 2018 Update:</u></b>  <b>Not implemented</b>                      IT with ZWD is soliciting many companies to demonstrate their invoicing, customer service, and routing systems. With the conclusion of the demonstrations, IT will develop an RFP that will solicit proposals for systems that will integrate with erma.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b>  <b>Not Implemented</b></p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
				<p>IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. As the FUNDS system is in the process of being replaced, a new system was deemed necessary and IT issued an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. One proposal was received. If the proposal is accepted, software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019.</p> <p>The new system will require route optimization and will have</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
				<p>an onboard system for drivers containing route information based on address and service delivery type so that route-specific data can be collected on a going-forward basis. The details of this system will be evaluated and developed as part of implementation.</p> <p>In addition to these new systems, Public Works and Parks are also implementing a new computerized maintenance management system. Once that vendor has been selected, then 311 will issue an RFP for a new Customer Relationship Management system that will integrate with the Zero Waste solutions</p>
2.2	Work with the Department of Information Technology to create a link between RouteSmart and the	Public Works	Agree Zero Waste will work with IT to create the most efficient link between RouteSmart™ and the CRM system that can be created,	<p>April 2015</p> <p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b> <b>Not Implemented</b> IT has been able to create a</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
CRM system (or the software implementation of Recommendation 2.5 below).		given available resources. One solution, budget permitting, would be implementing the best of breed billing system that integrates with RouteSmart, rather than to trying to configure the CRM system to handle functions it was never designed to handle.	December 2019	<p>table that extracts customer information from the FUNDS\$ and RouteSmart™. However and due to the limitations of FUNDS\$, this link takes hours to download information into RouteSmart™ versus that the company states should take minutes. Therefore until the installation of the ERP process is completed, RouteSmart™ cannot be used to its full route optimization capabilities.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b>  <b><u>Not Implemented</u></b>                      Working with RouteSmart for further integration was deemed not worthwhile as that system does not integrate with ArcGIS which is the City's primary system for spatial data. IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
				<p>October 18, 2018. The RFP was for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. One proposal was received. If the proposal is accepted, software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019.</p> <p>In addition to these new systems, Public Works and Parks are also implementing a new computerized maintenance management system. Once that vendor has been selected, then 311 will issue an RFP for a new Customer Relationship Management system that will</p>



ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>					
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary	
				integrate with the Zero Waste solutions.	
2.3	Appoint individuals at the management, supervisory, and line staff levels to meet and identify Zero Waste Division operational and analytical reporting needs based on the performance goals at each level of the organization. Work with IT staff to determine responsibility and establish timelines for developing the reports.	Public Works	Agree.	September 2016	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  <b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b> <b>Implemented</b> ZWD along with IT, 311 Call Center, and Revenue Collection have established a monthly meeting to address operational and reporting needs; and create action plans to address those identified needs. These monthly reports included reviewing and analyzing as a Group: 1) monthly 311 calls on various the community members zero waste issues, 2) develop resolutions on community members' zero waste issues (reviewed weekly by 311 and ZWD personnel), and 3) review and resolve community members' LAGAN cases created by 311 calls.
2.4	Designate a business-	Public	Agree		5/09/2017 Status: not submitted



ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
				the Senior Solid Waste Supervisor and an Associate Management Analyst being tasked with route optimization once new software has been identified and implemented. As mentioned elsewhere in this table, an RFP process for this software is currently underway.
2.5	Assess the benefits of using mobile technologies that would allow drivers to enter information directly into the CRM system while on their routes, take pictures of why pickups were skipped, and implement electronic route books and other mobile field reporting. Include in the assessment changes to job responsibilities that	Public Works	<p>Agree</p> <p>The Zero Waste Division will work with Information Technology and Human Resources Departments to assess the pros, cons, and feasibilities of mobile technologies (hardware and software).</p>	<p>5/09/2017 Status: not submitted</p> <p><b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b>  <b>Not Implemented</b>                      ZWD with IT input has been working with the RouteSmart™ to determine if ZWD can utilize its mobile technology to improve route management and provide real-time service data to the customer service representatives in the 311 Call Centers. Fixed unit GPS units are available in the marketplace to track truck movements, such as,</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
<p>might require a meet and confer with union representatives. Purchase the software and hardware if cost beneficial.</p>			December 2019	<p>missed pickups. However and with any mobile technology, these systems are constantly involving and improving. Therefore, any investment in a mobile system will not be implemented until the City's ERP project vendor selected, contract awarded and then ZWD/IT needs assessment completed.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b> <b><u>Partially Implemented</u></b> IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. The RFP was for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. These</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>					
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>		<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
					systems will utilize onboard mobile hardware. In addition, this system will integrate with the new GPS solution which will integrate with the Zero Waste solution allowing for real time decision making and route information. Exact capabilities of both systems will be validated and coordinated as part of the contracting process once the vendors are selected.
2.6	Work jointly with the Department of Information Technology and the Department of Finance to develop and automate script flows in the CRM system to ensure that all cases undergo the appropriate reviews before a case can be closed. The final step in the script flow	Public Works	Agree	October 2016	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  <u><b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b></u> <b>Implemented.</b> ZWD, IT, 311 Call Center, and Finance have developed script flows with use of the CRM tracking systems to ensure all cases receive appropriate review prior to closing. These cases are compiled and reviewed weekly and monthly by ZWD, IT, 311

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
	should be a final review by someone who has authority to verify that all required steps have occurred before the case is closed.			Call Center, and Finance staff.
2.7	Use the reports developed from implementing recommendation 2.4 to monitor customer complaints and determine what impact the annual bid process has on customer service. If the information demonstrates the annual bid process significantly affects customer service, meet and confer with union representatives	Public Works  Agree  Zero Waste will use the CRM system to monitor customer complaints and help assess the effect of the yearly bid process.	January 2019	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  <b><u>January 23, 2018 Update:</u></b> <b>Not Implemented.</b> ZWD services 62 commercial route days and these ZWD's routes include: 42 refuse route days, 11 fiber (cardboard, paper) route days, 5 mixed recyclable route days and 6 plant debris/food waste routes days. After the new commercial accounts are optimized with existing commercial accounts/routes, ZWD will be in the position to numerically determine if the annual bid system is affecting customer service. With this information

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
<p>to discuss the elimination the annual route bidding process to help reduce customer complaints and improve service delivery.</p> <p>Implement change if agreement is reached.</p>			<p>June/August 2019</p>	<p>completed, this would enable ZWD to meet and confer with the Union.</p> <p><b><u>June 4, 2018 Update:</u></b>  <b>Not Implemented.</b>                      With the integration of an additional 440 commercial accounts (had been serviced by either Waste Management, Inc. or Republic Services, Inc.) completed March/April 2018, with existing commercial accounts/routes, ZWD is in the position to numerically determine if the annual bid system is affecting customer service in April 2019. When this information is completed, ZWD will have information to meet and confer with the Union.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b>  <b>Not Implemented</b>                      The annual bid process is set to</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>					
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary	
				begin February 2019 and its impacts will be evaluated June 2019	
2.8	Create a method for community members to track the status of their cases online, which will reduce the call volume to the 311 Call Center.	Information Technology	Agree This functionality will be available after the upgrade of our CRM system is complete, currently scheduled to be no later than the end of FY 2015.	June 2016	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  <u><b>January 23, 2018 Update:</b></u> <b>Not Implemented.</b> Currently 311 team members create cases and assigned them to the appropriate service queue for ZWD investigation and response. This system allows the City to internally track issues but the ability of community member to track independently or via the City website has not been linked. Currently the City is implementing an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) project to replace the FUNDS system and to update the City website. With the installation of the selected ERP, then the CRM



ATTACHMENT No. 1

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal				
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
			June 2020	<p>system can be integrated with the ERP system. This integration would allow community members' to track their issues, such as, missed pickups, cost of service, etc. only.</p> <p><b><u>March 12, 2019</u></b> <b><u>Not Implemented</u></b></p> <p>IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018 for a complete Zero Waste Solution. Software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019. Subsequently, IT will be issuing an RFP for a new 311 system to replace LAGAN that will integrate with the Zero Waste solution. One of the objective of these new systems is to</p>

ATTACHMENT No. 1

<b>Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal</b>				
<b>Findings and Recommendations</b>	<b>Lead Dept.</b>	<b>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</b>	<b>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</b>	<b>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</b>
				provide customers the ability to track their requests.