



Health, Housing, and  
Community Services Department  
**Housing & Community Services Division**

## MEMORANDUM

**To:** City of Berkeley Landmarks Preservation Commission

**From:** Asavari Devadiga, HHCS Community Development Project Coordinator

**Date:** January 6, 2025

**Subject:** **Consultation under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act for Proposed St. Paul Terrace at 2012-2024 Ashby Avenue**

### PURPOSE

The Health, Housing, and Community Services (HHCS) staff request feedback from the Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) in accordance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA). Specifically, LPC is asked to provide comments on the following areas surrounding St. Paul Terrace project site:

1. Area of Potential Effect (APE): Whether the APE is appropriate for the scale and nature of the proposed undertaking;
2. Historic properties: Whether there are historic properties within the APE (historic properties are defined as properties listed in or eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places); and
3. Effects: Whether the proposed undertaking would have any effects on historic properties within the APE.

### INTRODUCTION

The project team seeks feedback from the LPC for the proposed undertaking of affordable housing of St. Paul Terrace at 2012-2024 Ashby Avenue (proposed project or undertaking) by Community Housing Development Corporation of North Richmond (CHDC). This staff report provides a brief description of the proposed undertaking; the feedback requested from the LPC on the cultural resources survey report (herein referred to as the Report); and the anticipated next steps for the undertaking.

The City serves as the Responsible Entity under the National Environmental Policy Act of 1969 (NEPA), which requires federal agencies and their Responsible Entities to consider the environmental impact of proposed actions where these proposed actions receive or are anticipated to receive federal permits or funds. CHDC is seeking funding

*A Vibrant and Healthy Berkeley for All*

*Consultation under Section 106: St. Paul Terrace  
January 6, 2025  
Page 2 of 4*

from the Department of Housing and Urban Development for the project, therefore the project is subject to Section 106 of the NHPA and is considered a federal undertaking.

Section 106 seeks to accommodate historic preservation concerns with the needs of federal undertakings through consultation with agencies and interested parties. CHDC has contracted with Environmental Science Associates (ESA) to prepare the cultural resource survey report for the project in compliance with Section 106 of the NHPA. The Report is available online at: [https://berkeleyca.gov/sites/default/files/documents/2025-01-06\\_LPC\\_Item%209\\_Att1\\_2012-2014%20Ashby\\_St%20Paul%20Terrace%20Report.pdf](https://berkeleyca.gov/sites/default/files/documents/2025-01-06_LPC_Item%209_Att1_2012-2014%20Ashby_St%20Paul%20Terrace%20Report.pdf)

We request that the LPC provide feedback on the APE, the individual properties, and the findings in the Report. References to specific sections and page numbers of the Report are provided below.

#### PROPOSED UNDERTAKING

CHDC in partnership with St. Paul African Methodist Episcopal Church of Berkeley proposes to develop the St. Paul Terrace affordable housing project for low-income households. The project site at 21012-2024 Ashby Avenue currently contains a church, annex building and parking lot. The proposed project will involve demolishing the annex building and the parking lot and constructing a new 7-story residential building with a basement. The building will have a total of 50 units with a mix of 11 studios, 6 one-bedroom units, 18 two-bedroom units, and 15 three-bedroom units. Of the 50 units, 49 will be available for households earning 20% to 60% of the area median income (AMI). One two-bedroom unit will be an unrestricted manager's unit. Twenty units will be targeted at households with an income of 30% AMI or below, of which, 13 units will be set aside for seniors experiencing or at risk of homelessness.

This project is subject to NEPA because it would be partially funded by 25 project-based vouchers issued by the Berkeley Housing Authority under a federally funded program. CHDC secured State funds under the Multifamily Housing and Infill Infrastructure Grant programs. Further, the City reserved \$15.7 million (including predevelopment funds) for the project. The project was approved pursuant to Government Code Section 65913.4 (Senate Bill [SB] 35) and was subject to Streamlined Ministerial Approval Process Guidelines by California Department of Housing and Community Development. The construction schedule is contingent upon the State tax credit application; at this time construction is estimated to begin in late 2025.

#### PROJECT LOCATION AND AREA OF POTENTIAL EFFECTS (APE)

The proposed project would be located on Ashby Avenue between Adeline Street and Shattuck Avenue. To ensure consideration of indirect effects, four parcels within the APE and nine contiguous parcels on the same block along with five parcels directly across Ashby Avenue to the north were included in the Report. See **Figure 2, Page 6** of the Report linked above.

*Consultation under Section 106: St. Paul Terrace  
January 6, 2025  
Page 3 of 4*

The architectural APE (see detailed description on **Page 5** and **Figure 2, Page 6** of the Report) includes the four parcels that comprise the project site, nine contiguous parcels on the same block, and five parcels directly across Ashby Avenue to the north. The properties located within the APE are listed in Table 1 (**Page 5**) and keyed to Figure 2 (**Page 6**).

#### HISTORIC PROPERTIES: IDENTIFICATION AND EFFECTS

A cultural resources survey report was prepared to document the methods and results of a cultural resources inventory completed for the St. Paul Terrace Project. The Report records the existing conditions of the project site regarding architectural cultural resources for use as required under Section 106 of the NHPA.

Work performed consisted of background and archival research, including: a records' search of the California Historical Resources Information System (CHRIS); research on existing cultural resources literature; an intensive-level pedestrian survey of the APE; significance evaluations of identified cultural resources; and Finding of Effects recommendation. The Report also incorporates the records' search at the Northwest Information Center at Sonoma State University that was conducted as part of a separate archaeological study. Efforts to identify cultural resources that could qualify as Section 106 historic properties within the APE also included a review of historic maps and aerial photography of the APE; an intensive-level pedestrian survey; and evaluation of existing buildings in the APE.

The results of the records search indicated that there are no previously recorded architectural cultural resources in the APE. Based on a review of the Built Environment Resources Database (BERD) maintained by the State of California Office of Historic Preservation (OHP), there are 13 previously recorded architectural resources are located within 0.5 mile of the APE (see **Table 3, Page 16** of the Report). Only one, 2727 Milvia Street (Berkeley Iceland), is listed on the National Register of Historic Places (National Register). None are located within the APE. The Report (**Pages 17-45**) presents brief architectural descriptions, construction chronologies and summaries of archival research for the 13 historic-age properties in the APE that meet the 45-year age threshold required for consideration of eligibility for listing in the National Register. Additional and expanded historical information for each property in the APE is presented in the DPR 523 forms included in Appendix A of the Report.

While the group of 13 Subject Properties reflects the historically mixed-use (residential and commercial) character of the Ashby Station neighborhood, they do not – individually or collectively – represent a unique, rare, or particularly influential example of this urban development trend. Each property within the APE is a modest and altered example of its property type and architectural style and are not associated with a master architect or designer. Therefore, as per the Report the group of 13 Subject Properties are recommended as ineligible for listing on the National Register as a historic district under any criteria.

*Consultation under Section 106: St. Paul Terrace*  
*January 6, 2025*  
Page 4 of 4

ESA recommends that no buildings located within the APE appear to be individually eligible for listing in the National Register, nor does any grouping of buildings within the APE appear to constitute or contribute to a known or potential National Register District. As such, ESA recommends a finding of No Historic Properties Affected for the project (**Chapter 5** of the Report).

#### FUTURE ACTION

In order to meet critical funding deadlines for the projects, staff respectfully request LPC submit comments or questions at the scheduled LPC meeting on Monday, January 6<sup>th</sup>, 2025.

Following this consultation with LPC and the public, staff will send a letter to the State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) with a summary of findings. SHPO will have 30 days to evaluate the City's findings and either concur or disagree with them. If the City finds no potentially adverse effects, and SHPO concurs with the City's findings, the undertaking may proceed without further review of historic resources in the APE. If there is disagreement between the City and SHPO, discussions and negotiations will continue until a settlement is reached.

#### Attachments:

1. Environmental Science Associates, St. Paul Terrace Project, Alameda County, California, Cultural Resources Survey Report, 2024.